IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA

LORI ANN MORRIS

VERSUS

* No. 3:05-CV-962-T

EDWARD NEAL THOMPSON AND FLORIDA TRANSFORMER

* * * * * *

The deposition of ANDRE E. LeBLEU, P.E., 17474
Opportunity Avenue, Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 708147470, taken by counsel for the Defendant at the
Office of Edward A. Robinson III, Esq., 600 North
Foster Drive, Baton Rouge, Louisiana, commencing at

10:36 a.m. on July 26, 2006.

CERTIFIED COPY

Reported by: Kelly G. Young, CCR

Registered Professional Reporter

LEBLEU 22 retained by anybody to testify? Q. And tell me, kind of break down what else 2 A. That's correct. 2 you do. I don't know much about electrical 3 Q. And who was it that first contacted you engineering. 4 about testifying in this case? A. Beyond that we do designs, which we 5 A. We received a call from Dr. Robinson, I implement in whatever facilities that we're 6 believe. contracted to do so. We develop a design which 7 Q. All right. Let me ask you this. Through specifies every part and piece that goes with the 8 the course of -- how long have you been an engineer? electrical system. Not the major parts. We'll tell 9 A. Since 1987. them the wire, how to install the wire, how to 10 Q. All right. Let me just kind of go through connect it, the equipment that's going to connect 10 your resume here. You've been -- LAPTEC has been in 11 11 it, all the breakers, the protective devices in the 12 existence since 1999? breakers, down to the motors. We look at how it's 12 13 A. It probably started a few years before 13 going to be loaded, so forth. Do you need more 14 then. 14 detail? 15 Q. Were you one of the founders of LAPTEC? 15 That's plenty right there. 16 Q. What are you doing these designs for? Is A. I got in after it was founded. 16 17 Q. Have you held the same position as 17 it buildings; is it computers; is it cars? vice-president the entire time you've been there? 18 A. We basically provide power for buildings, 19 A. That's correct. 19 industrial systems. That's pretty much it. We 20 Q. And in your dealings at LAPTEC, have you 20 analyze systems, also, for various electrical 21 ever investigated any electrical systems for 18 21 properties to make sure they operate within safe 22 wheelers? 22 applications. 23 A. No. 23 Q. Any of your design work, has that ever been 24 Q. Have you ever done it in your experience 24 done for 18 wheelers? ever? 25 A No. 23 25 Q. What about any kind of vehicles or 1 2 Q. I'm not going to go -- what did you do at 2 automotive equipment? 3 **Power and Control Systems in Baton Rouge?** 3 A. No. 4 A. Basically the same things I've done for 4 Q. Anything other than buildings? 5 LAPTEC. 5 A. It's basically going to be power systems 6 Q. Okay. And what about Bertrand Engineers? that we've done for whatever, motors that supply 7 A. All of these except the beginning ones. 7 power to motors or devices or something within a FAA, was basically -- we were working more with 8 facility. 9 radar systems instead of commercial industrial 9 Q. When you say motors, is that kind of like 10 electrical systems. 10 if you were in a plant --11 Q. Tell me generally what you concentrate on. 11 A. That's right. 12 Do you work on buildings? 12 Q. -- and they've got a big old generator or 13 A. I work primarily on electrical systems, 13 something running, that's what you're talking about? 14 protection of electrical systems. We're considered 14 A. Yes. I'm going to get electrical power to 15 to be experts on every aspect of electrical systems. power motors or lights or any types of things that 15 16 Q. You said protection of electrical systems. 16 require electrical service. Would that be like from power surges or lightning 17 17 Q. You started with FAA, and then you moved 18 strikes? 18 back to Baton Rouge and have been here ever since

24 Is that correct? 25 A. That's what we attempt to do.

Q. All right. So that's your primary focus.

Q. What percentage do you think of your work

is devoted towards protection of electrical systems?

A. That would be that, that's correct.

I would say 50 percent at least.

19

20

21

22

23

23 Q. And where did you go to college? 24

A. I went to the University -- it's now

doing that same kind of work?

Q. When were you born?

A. That's correct.

25 University of Louisiana at Lafayette.

A. Nineteen sixty-four.

19

20

21

22

Г				
1	And what did you me	26	1 .	28
2	•	ajor in Giere?	1	litigation fees.
3		ny further education	2	
4		ny faraier education	3	services. Q. That's what we're dealing with here?
5		cically continuing	5	A. That's right.
6			6	Q. Straight time hourly rates?
7		•	7	A. We have a minimum four hour call out.
8	••		8	O. What's overtime?
9		.,	9	A. Anything unplanned or anything after eight
10	, ,		10	hours.
11	Q. I'm pretty sure I kno	w the answer to this	11	Q. All right. Anything over eight hours a
12			12	day?
13		=	13	A. That's right.
14		- ·	14	Q. And then premium rates, what does that
15	any trucking accidents when	-	15	include?
16	over. Is that correct?		16	A. That means if you call me out at two or
17	A. That's correct.		17	three in the morning and you want me to come out
18	Q. Who actually typed ti	his affidavit?	18	now.
19	A. Dr. Robinson's office typ	ed it.	19	Q. I don't blame you. What about depositions?
20	Q. And then sent it to yo	ou?	20	A. We're going to keep it on straight time.
21	A. That's right.		21	Q. What about trial testimony?
22	Q. For your review?	;	22	A. What's that?
23	A. That's right.	·	23	Q. Trial testimony?
24	Q. Did you make any cha	anges to it between the	24	A. Straight time.
25	time that you first saw it and	d its final form?	25	DR. ROBINSON:
	A. Ves There	27		29
1	A. Yes, I have,	Ele?	1	Could I just indicate that there is
2	Q. You have those in youA. Yes.	our mes	2	preparation time that he had. He'd be
4	Q. Could I see those, pl	Socos	3 4	happy to answer that. BY MR. BRITTAIN:
5	A. (Tendering document.)	case:	5	Q. Have you kept up with the time you've got
6	Q. This appears to be a	fax dated March 30th.	6	in this case?
7	'05. Tell me, was this wa	· 1	7	A. I can yes, I have to some extent.
8	prepared by Dr. Robinson, f		8	Q. Do you have that with you today?
9	reviewed, made changes to		9	A. I do not.
10	then what I've marked as E	xhibit 2 was the final	10	Q. What I'd ask you to do - how do you keep up
11	result after that?		11	with your time?
12	 A. That's correct. 		12	A. I normally have a time sheet. Being this
13	MR. BRITTAIN:		13	is the first time I've done this I've been less than
14	Can I get a copy of the	hat, a separate	14	stringent about keeping up with that. I've been
15	copy of that?		15	actually pretty relaxed about it.
16	DR. ROBINSON:	.	16	Q. Can you get me a copy of that?
17	Okay. We were going	- '	17	A. Well, I kind of think that it would
1.8	the whole book for you.	ļ	18	probably not be real observant of what I've done
19	MR. BRITTAIN:	1		because, you know, I try not to at this point I
20	That right there I war	1		didn't know what was going on so I was putting out
21	an exhibit.	į.		no overhead. I was having to make up my other
22	(Off-the-record.)	1		hours. I didn't know how this was going to go. So
	BY MR. BRITTAIN:			I said, well, I'm going to put just an hour or two
24	Q. We'll mark what you as Exhibit 3. This is your set			here, and then I'm going to cover my lost time with
25	as Exhibit 3. This is your rat	e sneet for LAPTEC'S	25	other jobs. I think we can talk about it, and I can

	3	в	40
1	1 I'm going to take that in I'm going to read this	1	
- 1	2 and say okay, and then I'm going to go look at the	2	
1	3 Kenworth data and take that, and I'm going to look	3	
- [4 at pictures and say does that make sense, and from	4	
- 1	5 there that's where I came up with this. To say that	5	2 3
- 1	6 this influences exactly what I'm going to say I can	6	
	7 say no.	7	or and approximation, and a grant gr
- i	Q. That didn't have any influence on your	8	
	9 opinion?	9	should have been visible to my client?
11	A. It may have some influence on my opinion	10	A. More probable than not. Hold on. Let me
1	1 from the fact that I read this, but the final	11	say this. More probable than not that the lights
12	• •	12	were on. Were they visible to your client, I cannot
13	Q. Now, you've looked at the accident report.	13	•
14	Have you ever picked up the phone and called either	14	Q. So as far you don't know where the trees
15	one of the state troopers?	15	are on the side of the interstate, do you?
16	A. I did not.	16	A. Where the what?
. 17	Q. Have you ever talked to anybody that was	17	Q. Whether there are any trees on the side of
18	involved in this accident?	18	the interstate right here?
19	A. I did not.	19	A. From the pictures that I saw I didn't see
20	Q. All right. You reviewed the photographs	20	any trees.
21	that the state troopers took. Is that right?	21	Q. That's based on the pictures, right?
22	A. That is correct.	22	A. That's correct.
23	Q. Did you review the photographs that Dr.	23	Q. So you have not taken any measurements as
24	Robinson I'm going to call Dr. Robinson the	24	far as where the embankment is or anything like that
25	expert I'm going to call him Dr. Robinson. I'm	25	at the accident scene. Is that correct?
<u></u>		_	
	39		41
1	going to call you Attorney Robinson. All right?	1	A. No.
2	DR. ROBINSON:	2	Q. You're not aware of any kind of curvature
3	That's fine.	3	there is of the road other than what you might have
4	A. Yes.	4	seen from photographs. Is that correct?
5	BY MR. BRITTAIN:	5	 A. From this data right here that's what I
6	Q. Did you review those photographs?	6	have.
7	A. I did.	7	Q. You've not inspected the Kenworth that Mr.
8	Q. Looks like you reviewed aerial photos of	8	Morris was driving at the time of this accident.
9	the accident scene?	9	That's correct?
10	A. Yes.	10	A. That's correct.
11	Q. And reviewed a forensic map created by Dr.	11	DR. ROBINSON:
12	Robinson?	12	Other than the pictures?
13	A. Yes.	13	A. That's correct.
14	Q. There's a couple of forensic maps that have	14	BY MR. BRITTAIN:
15	been created. Whichever one you looked at, is that	15	Q. You went out and looked at a Kenworth a
16	going to be in your book?	16	couple of days ago it sounds like or earlier this
17	A. Yes.	17	week or last week. Is that correct?
18	Q. You've not been to the accident scene. Is	18	A. Last couple of weeks.
19	that correct?	19	Q. And then you saw one other Kenworth
20	A. I have not.	20	sometime before you prepared this report. Is that
21	Q. Do you why haven't you gone out there?	21	correct?
22	A. I've only been told to look at the	22	A. I wouldn't say just one. We've looked at a

23 number of them, but in depth I looked at one.

25 that you looked at it before you prepared the

Q. And where was this done? Where was it done

23 electrical system and I asked -- I'm not sure who I

24 asked, one of the Robinsons, if we could view the

25 truck, and when I became involved apparently the

20

21

22

24

report, right?

A. That's right.

the record. You've done work since you've done this

Q. Okay. Do you think it would be helpful for

you to review Dr. Robinson's deposition in order to

get a better understanding of what all is going on

	DLEU		
١.	40	- F	4
1 2		1	•
3		2	• •
4		3	
5	·	4	
6		5	,
7		6 7	right?
8	•	8	
9	Q. And who provided those to you?	9	Q. Maybe it would, maybe it wouldn't? A. Right.
10	•	10	-
11	MR. ROBINSON:	11	correctly, to offer you tell me, what are you
12	Mr. Penick.	12	going to offer opinions on?
13	BY MR. BRITTAIN;	13	A. I'm going to offer the opinion that more
14	Q. Mr. Penick?	14	probably than not that the electrical system was
15	A. Yes.	15	operating and the lights were more probably than not
16	Q. He did not provide you with the deposition	16	on,
17	of Sergeant Patterson?	17	Q. You're not here to offer any opinion as to
18	A. No.	18	compliance with or violation of Federal Motor
19	Q. And he did not provide you with the	19	Carrier Safety Regulations?
20	deposition of Dr. Edward Robinson?	20	A. That's correct.
21	A. That's correct.	21	Q. And you're not qualified to render any
22	Q. Have you asked to be allowed to see those?	22	opinion on
23	A. I didn't know about the one from the	23	A. That's correct.
24	sergeant, and Dr. Robinson, I felt like that was	24	Q. You're not going to offer any opinions on
25	I didn't ask because he was going to be talking	25	cause of death. Is that correct?
	47		49
1	about things separate than the electrical.	1	A. That's correct.
2	Q. In your report here you said you've	2	Q. And, again, you're not qualified to render
3	reviewed things from Dr. Robinson?	3	any of those opinions?
4	A. That's right.	4	A. That's correct.
5	Q. All right. But you don't think it would be	5	Q. Are you familiar with any cases involving
6	good to see exactly what he had to say?	6	rollovers?
7	DR. ROBINSON:	7	A. No.
8	We'll object to the form, Counsel,	8	Q. This is your very first one?
9	because he's indicated that this report was	9	A. That's correct.
10	written prior to any deposition of Dr.	10	Q. And you stated this earlier. I want to
1	Robinson. The date of his report and his	11	make sure I understand. You're not here to offer
2	affidavit is there for you to see. It was	12	any opinions as it relates to any kind of accident
.3 .4	back in March of 2005, and I think Dr.	13	reconstruction?
4 5	Robinson's deposition was just only taken	14	A. That's correct.
5 6	within last few weeks here. Subject to	15	Q. Again, you're not qualified to render those
	that. BY MR. BRITTAIN:	16	opinions?
	1	17	A. That's correct.
8	Q. You can answer. He's got to put that on	18	Q. Along with that, that encompasses a lot of

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

approached?

A. No.

things, but you're not qualified to render any

opinions on the speed of the vehicles, either the

Q. And you're not qualified to render any

opinions as to perception reaction time. Is that

Kenworth when it rolled over or the Peterbilt as it

2

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

24

10

11

12

13

14

15

63

62

64

65

9

10

15

16

19

20

21

22

5

6

7

11

14

18

19

think after the Peterbilt hit it I've got to guess that everything is -- all bases are off after the, 3 you know, after it got hit by the truck. 4 Q. What do you mean by that? 5 A. I don't know what affect that would have on 6 the switches. 7 Q. Do you know what affect that a rollover 8

would have on those switches?

A. I would tend to think at this point that the switches were pretty sticky.

11 Q. Now, you think that an impact would have I 12 guess messed everything up so bad that you can't really tell anything, but a rollover would not have 14 that affect?

A. I can't say that.

Q. I'm trying to understand what you just told me though.

17 18 A. This is what I have to -- from what I

understand the impact tore the cab off the truck, Q. How did you come to that understanding?

A. I got that off -- I read that someplace.

Q. Do you remember where you read that?

23 A. I must have read it off the Dr. Robinson

report. Then all bets are off on what state the

switches were or anything at that point.

A. No.

Q. Would you agree with me that that would tend to indicate that there was some pretty significant force going on on this rollover

collision if that's the number one cause of

6 death --

A. I don't know that --

DR. ROBINSON:

Object. You're asking questions outside of his expertise, Counsel. Calls

for speculation.

BY MR, BRITTAIN:

Q. Let me make sure I understand. You're saying that the photograph of the dashboard control panels, you're not as concerned with that any more because the destruction that would have been caused by the impact would have been so severe that it

18 wouldn't be helpful?

19 A. Yes. Nobody can say what the impact would

20 have done to the switches.

21 Q. And I guess the same could be said with 22 respect to the rollover, too. Is that right?

23 A. I don't know.

Q. Number 3 here says, Were the lights turned

25 off by anyone at the scene? Why is that important?

Q. What's your understanding -- so I guess based on the force of the impact between the 3 Peterbilt and the Kenworth, is that what you're 4

A. From the cab being torn off the trailer from what I understand. From what I understand. I don't know exactly where I got that from right at

8 this point. I can't say what happened after that.

9 Q. But you've never investigated an 18 wheeler 10 that's rolled over before, have you?

A. That's correct.

12 Q. You don't know what kind of force is 13 involved in a rollover event, do you?

A. I do not know.

Q. Are you aware of the fact that many times 15 16 people are killed in a rollover when a truck rolls 17 over? Are you aware of that?

A. You're telling it to me.

Q. Did you know that that happens?

20 A. I can't say that I knew that or don't know

21 that.

22 Q. I'll represent to you that when we took

23 Trooper Patterson's deposition he said that is the

24 most common cause of fatalities in trucking wrecks

25 is rollovers. Were you aware of that?

A. I just want to know. Clearly that would 2 indicate that the lights were on.

3 Q. Number 4, What was the position of the key in the ignition at the scene. What does that mean?

5 A. We were just -- at that point we didn't 6 quite know everything involved so we wanted to know was the truck running, was it not running? Now we 8 know that with the truck off it doesn't have any 9 affect on the lights.

Q. So No. 4 doesn't matter?

A. That's right.

Q. Number 5, What is the condition of the lights on the truck and trailer now? Do the lights appear to be intact and functional? Tell me why that's important.

16 A. Obviously, that's going to affect if the 17 lights can be used or not after the impact or 18 whatever. This is our initial question trying to 19 find out what went on so we could formulate our 20

21 Q. Is that still something that you think as we sit here today is pretty important to know? 22

23 A. It would be nice to know.

24 Q. Number 6, What is the type and manufacture 25 of each battery? Tell me why you need to know that.

_			
	7	8	8
1	copy of this back?	1	the model T600 brochure?
2		2	A. I did get a T600 brochure off the internet.
3	Let us make a copy of it first, and	3	Q. Does that have the schematics of the
4	then you can mark it.	4	wiring?
5	(Off-the-record.)	5	A. No. I think it's got the same pictures.
6	BY MR. BRITTAIN:	6	DR. ROBINSON:
7	Q. I'm going to mark this as 11. I want you	7	The same schematic.
8	to take my pen and draw on here the wire that you	a 8	MR. BRITTAIN:
9	were just talking about that was the most	9	If you will, will you I'm going to
10	A. (Complied with request.)	10	need a copy of that, too.
11	Q. And what does that wire run from and to?	11	DR. ROBINSON:
12	A. I don't know.	12	Could we do all of these or just
13	Q. Do you even know if it has anything to do	13	the pertinent pages?
14	with the lights?	14	MR. BRITTAIN:
15	A. No, I don't know if it has anything to do	15	I do want the whole thing.
16	with that. My contention is that on the rollover	16	DR. ROBINSON:
17	this right here is usually going to be one of the	17	Let me go and make the whole thing
18	things that impacts the ground. And even after	18	
19	getting hit by the Peterbilt, this right here, which	19	(Off-the-record.)
20	was probably one of the points rubbing on the	20	
21	ground, seems to me that it would have, by all of	21	Q. The schematic that you're showing me ther
22	this damage right here that this is still in good	22	that's the connection of the
23	shape.	23	A. This is the way they the wiring and all
24	Q. What you're saying is that one way for the	24	of their devices are contained within the C beam.
25	wiring to be destroyed or the lights would be if the	25	Q. In the trailer?
<u> </u>		ļ.,,,	
	. 79		83
1	truck slid along its side and the contact between	1	A. That's right.
2	the wire and the pavement basically destroyed the	2	Q. What about in the tractor?
3	connection?	3	A. The tractor, I know that it's got, from
4	A. What I'm saying is if the wire, the wire is	4	what I can remember from just looking, it's got all
5	held securely in the truck and being it would	5	of the wiring contained within basically the metal
6	stay there. Being this was at a point where it	6	parts within the trailer protected from the
7	would be most apt from what I can see to be in	7	environment, things like that. It also has kind of
8	contact with the ground, it was protected enough	8	a bungle cord type attachment with some locked hubs.
9	that any other wiring within the truck would	9	Q. And that's based on you opening up the hood
10	probably not be damaged from this exhibit right	10	of some of these tractor trailers?
11	here for lack of a better word.	11	A. Just looking at them.
12	Q. There wasn't any wiring at all damaged in	12	Q. Would that be I guess early on when you
13	the truck is what you're saying?	13	would look at the ones that would pull up where you
14	A. I don't know that.	14	all were, or is that from your inspection of the
15	Q. The wiring that you and I just went over	15	Kenworths at the Kenworth dealership?
16	that's tell me what model we were looking at.	16	A. It would be early on.
17	A. We were talking about a T800.	17	Q. And you don't know whether on the tractors
18	Q. That's not the tractor that was involved in	18	you had been looking at there whether any changes
19	this accident, is it?	19	had been made to that, do you, to those tractors?
20	A. No, that's not it.	20	A. I can't say specifically about the tractor
21	Q. Do you know whether the tractor that was	21	that Mr. Morris was driving.
22 i	involved in this is wired the same way as that	22	Q. You have no idea what the wiring was like
	tractor?	23	in the tractor of Mr. Morris?
24	A. I don't know that. I assume so.	24	A. No, that is correct.
25	Q. Is there any reason why you haven't gotten	25	DR. ROBINSON:

23

24

that you are asking.

filament would withstand it. Answering the guestion

25 force on the interior filaments and the exterior

Q. Assuming that there was a difference in

Case 3:05-cv-00962-MHT-SRW

104 102 inner side lights. 1 1 filaments. 2 Q. You're talking about these two things right 2 A. We can't say that. I don't know that. 3 here on the last page? 3 Q. I know you don't, but assume that there was 4 A. Right. for purposes of this question. I get to ask you 5 Q. So you say, based on the fact that the hypothetical questions. 6 filaments were intact on these looks like overhead 6 DR. ROBINSON: lights inside the cab, you think the filaments in 7 At what point in time? Are you the headlights, taillights and everything else would 8 talking about at the time of the --9 not have been damaged or would still remain intact? 9 BY MR. BRITTAIN: 10 A. More probable than not. 10 Q. Is there ever a point in time, is there a 11 DR. ROBINSON: situation where the exterior force on the filaments 11 12 Note, too, that he pointed to a 12 on the exterior lights would be greater than the 13 headlight there in answer to your question force on the interior -- interior light filament 13 14 earlier. 14 that that situation could happen? 15 BY MR. BRITTAIN: 15 A. I can't say as a mechanical. I'm not a 16 Q. Do you have any earthly idea on the 16 mechanical. If I hit a vehicle, or a structure or 17 difference in the amount of force that would have 17 something like that I'm hitting it with a certain been applied to the interior lights versus the amount of force. So everything that I'm hitting is 18 19 amount of force that will be applied to the exterior 19 going to be exposed to that force whether it's 20 lights in the course of a rollover? contained inside or outside. I'm confused by the 20 21 A. No, I would -- I'm not going to go there. 21 question. I don't know how to respond. If you said that I have two bulbs and I hit 22 Q. And there is a certain amount of force --22 23 there's only a certain amount of force that a 23 them with a different amount of force I could say, filament is going to withstand before it's going to 24 yes, the one that's hit with the more force the break, right? 25 filaments probably would be, you know, assuming we 105 103 1 A. Yes. damaged both of them, this one would be more 2 Q. So if the force applied to the exterior damaged. If I hit this one with more force would lights was much greater than the force applied to there be a better chance the one hit with more force the interior light, it's very likely that those would break more than the other one with less? Yes. lights would have gone out and the interior lights 5 Q. The lights on this tractor trailer, they could go out for numerous different reasons. Isn't 6 or at least the filaments would not be damaged. Is 6 7 that fair to say? 7 that right? 8 A. Please restate the question. 8 That's correct. g Q. If the force that was exerted on the 9 Q. One would be like if you went up to them 10 with a baseball bat and busted them all out. That's exterior light filaments was much greater than the 10 force exerted on the interior light filaments, is it 11 11 one way, right? 12 likely that the exterior light filaments would be 12 A. Right. 13 Q. Or the damage that would be put on the damaged while the interior light filaments would 13 14 remain intact? actual light and the filament itself from either the 14 15 A. Well, I don't think that's a question that 15 rollover or the collision. Is that right? 16 we can answer because we don't know the difference 16 A. That's correct. 17 between the force. How can you say there's a 17 Q. Another way would be if a wire was severed 18 difference in force? 18 or cut and the electricity could no longer get to 19 Q. Just assume for purposes of my question 19 it. Is that correct? 20 20 A. Absolutely. 21 A. There could be a difference in how the 21 Q. And that could also happen either in a

22

23

24

25

rollover or from impact. Is that correct?

battery to malfunction?

Q. And another way I guess would be for the

21

22

23

24

aware of that, aren't you?

electrical systems.

A. There are design defects in all kind of

I think, and I had to go in there because my

taillights went out two months after I bought it.

Q. I've got a Chevy Trail Blazer. It's a 2004

106 108 1 A. That's right. 1 So you're aware that does happen, aren't you? 2 Q. Are there any other ways that you could 2 A. Yes. 3 conceive of that the lights could go out? 3 Q. All right. Were you able to rule out any 4 A. I think we've touched on them all. kind of design defect in this particular instance? 5 Q. What if the alternator goes out? 5 A. When did this -- this accident happened 6 A. Alternator -- admittedly I'm going to be 6 like what time, what year? 7 weak on this one. The alternator is basically a 7 Q. This accident we're here about today? 8 means for the engine to convert electricity to DC to 8 A. I think it happened in 2003. 9 9 feed it into the system. I think if you still had Q. Two thousand four. 10 the batteries then the lights would come on. 10 A. Two thousand four and he's got a '98. 11 Q. I've been driving down the road one time, That's the only thing -- from what we understand he 12 my alternator went out and I was -has I believe a '98 Kenworth. So if at that point 12 13 A. You were dead. 13 he was having some electrical problems certainly he 14 would have known about them or somebody would have Q. Right. 14 15 A. I can't accurately state on this truck what 15 known about them. 16 would happen. The alternator, from what I 16 Q. You would think? 17 understand, is a means to convert to DC. 17 A. Yes. That's the only thing I can say. 18 Q. Do you know whether or not the alternator Q. What about with respect to batteries, are 18 19 went out on this tractor trailer as he was riding 19 you aware of batteries being designed defectively? down the road, and his lights went off, and he was 20 A. Yes, batteries are defective. My 21 stuck there with no lights at 2:30 in the morning? experience with batteries is if you have a defective 21 22 A. I don't know. battery you know about it very quickly. A defective 22 23 Q. Is that a possibility? 23 battery usually doesn't last any period of time. 24 Once you get a battery that operates generally it's A. I don't know. 24 25 Q. You can't say that didn't happen, can you? okay for whatever period that it's going to last. 109 107 1 A. I cannot say that didn't happen. 1 Q. You don't know, this battery could have 2 Q. We went through the electrical system here. 2 been put in two hours before he got on the road? Have you ever -- are you aware of the fact that 3 A. Certainly. 4 Q. So you're not able to rule out the there are times where electrical systems are 4 5 designed improperly? 5 possibility of a battery design defect, are you? 6 A. Yes, that's true. However, these trucks 6 A. I can't say anything about the battery. I 7 are, you know, obviously we're sitting here for 7 have no idea about them in this case. liability reasons, and truck and car manufacturers 8 Q. You cannot rule it out. You're not saying 9 that that's what caused it, but you can't rule it are going to do the things they have to do to make sure their electrical system is insulated and so 10 out either? forth so they can't be subject to those liabilities. 11 Certainly. These are not for the most part -- and I can't say 12 Q. And you don't know what kind of battery it 13 if Mr. Morris has done anything or anybody else, but was? You don't know how old it was? You don't know 13 who manufactured it or anything like that? these are not custom systems. This is we designed 14 15 15 this system for this truck, or a truck, or a series 16 16 O. What about manufacturing defects, are you 17 Q. You're familiar though with vehicles -- I'm 17 familiar that manufacturing defects are present 18 limited just to vehicles, that there are design 18 within electrical systems in vehicles? 19 defects in electrical systems in vehicles. You're 19 A. Again, that's just like saying anything.

20

21

22

23

24

25

2003 --

BY MR. BRITTAIN:

Being he had a '98 and this accident occurred in

That would have become obvious to someone.

DR. ROBINSON:

September 12, 2004.

2

3

4

5

7

8

10

11

12

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

22

110 Q. When I talk about manufacturing defects -do you understand the difference between a manufacturing defect and a design defect?

A. Yes. If there was a mistake -- go ahead.

Q. But you understand that the materials that are used can oftentimes be different between the same even make and model of vehicles; you get a bad batch of something. You understand what I'm talking

9 about?

A. Right.

Q. Do you know whether that was the case here with respect to anything in the electrical system?

13 A. I can't specifically say that. I know that 14 from electrical systems there's things that you have to do to test them to make sure that they're going 16 to be okay.

17 Q. But the wiring eventually is going to wear 18 out and everything. Is that fair to say?

19 A. Insulation can fail. But they've got to 20 the point where this insulation lasts countless 21 years. It depends on -- there's things he could have done to the truck that would have done 23 something. But, you know, from what I've seen in

our applications wiring is good to go for sometimes

20, 30 years if it's kept in a manner that it

assuming were on, as they were coming towards this

2 Kenworth?

A. No, I cannot. The one thing I can say is I 3

know that -- and I made it a point to look at that

quite a bit. I don't know if there's a specific

rule, and this is just from me looking on the

highway, that there's a light situated in the middle

of a trailer, and I'm pretty sure that most trucks

have to have them. I got that when I was talking to

a trucker earlier in the last couple of weeks, that

there's a light situated in the middle of the

12 trailer that has to be on.

13

18

19

20

25

6

7

8

13

15

21

23

111

Q. Where on the trailer are you talking about?

A. It's situated -- it's probably somewhere in 14 15

the middle of the trailer.

Q. Are you talking about underneath the 16 17 trailer?

A. On both sides of the trailer.

Q. All right.

A. So that when I drive by the trailer, that

21 light, I can look out the side of my vehicle and see

22 it. It's a yellow light.

23 Q. Do you know whether that was on this 24 particular trailer?

A. From what I understand I cannot -- I was

1 doesn't move and things like that.

Q. As long as it's maintained properly?

A. Correct.

Q. And as long as there's no defect in the actual I guess the wiring or the insulation?

A. It would be the insulation.

Q. And you're not able to rule out the possibility of improper maintenance or improper insulation?

10 A. I cannot say anything about those two. If 11 those did occur that's something I can't verify or 12 not verify.

13 Q. All right. Tell me this. Do you have any 14 idea where the Kenworth tractor was pointing prior 15 to impact?

16 A. All I have on where it was going was the 17 reports I have from the Robinsons.

18 Q. Let me ask you this. So if Dr. Robinson 19 doesn't have any earthly idea where the tractor was 20 located, therefore, you would have no idea either, 21 would you?

A. That's right.

23 Q. And do you have -- are you offering any 24 opinion as to how far back Mr. Thompson or Mr.

Tidwell should have been able to see these lights,

not able to locate it on here because the pictures

we took don't show that, but that light should have

been -- you just can't see it because of the way the

thing is, but there should have been a light

5 somewhere in the middle of the trailer.

DR. ROBINSON:

Do you think that was federally

mandated?

9 A. I can go look that up but, you know, when

10 you walk outside look for a tractor trailer and see

if one passes by. I'd have to find out that. 11

12 BY MR. BRITTAIN:

Q. But on this one you don't know whether it 14 was ever installed on the trailer?

I tried to say that. That's correct.

Q. Let me ask you this. You were talking 16 about the wiring systems as they relate to the 17 Kenworth in that book you had, the wiring showed

18 going through that trailer, do you know whether that 19

was the same trailer, whether it was a Kenworth

20

trailer that was on this tractor?

22 A. Say again, if that was the same --

Q. Trailer that was originally on this

24 tractor?

25 A. No, I can't say that. 113

LEBLEU 114 1 Q. Back to the light. You don't know whether 1 think your general understanding is that there are 2 it was ever put on there to begin with, and you no trees there. If you've got lights shining off 2 3 don't know whether even if was it had been removed into nothing and there's nothing to reflect the 4 by the time this accident happened? light back, are you going to be able to see that? 5 A. I can't say whether the light was on or 5 DR. ROBINSON: 6 off. I think that is probably something we have to 6 Are you asking him who could see, him 7 find out about. That's something that Panther, too, 7 or the driver, Mr. Thompson or his 8 passenger could see? Are you asking him to would know about. 9 9 give an opinion on what they saw or didn't Q. Did you call them to find that out? 10 A. I did not do that. 10 see? 11 Q. Now, are you aware that there was some 11 BY MR. BRITTAIN: 12 damage done to the trailer, it was bent up during Q. Let me ask you this. How far out do those 12 the rollover? 13 headlights usually work on a tractor trailer? A. I don't know. 14 A. No, I wasn't specifically aware of that. 14 15 Q. Do you know whether there was any? 15 Q. You don't know if you are driving it 16 A. No. I did see them going through the 16 regular how far down the road you could see? 17 median and all that. 17 A. I don't -- I can't say. 18 Q. You're aware it drove through a median I Q. You don't know the power, however you want 18 19 think about 150 feet or 150 yards, I can't remember, to call it, illumination of the headlights or 19 20 before coming back up and rolling over? anything like that? 21 A. I saw the reconstruction map, yes. 21 A. I don't know that. 22 Q. Do you know whether when it went through 22 Q. You tell me whether you're familiar with that median then whether that light could have been 23 lights to the extent of how far away people can see knocked off or disabled, assuming it was even on them, why you're able to see a light, whether it be there? 25 reflection or something like that. Is that 115 1 A. I can't say whether it was or not. 1 2 Q. Back to what they could or could not see 2 on? then. Are you able to tell me that, you know, 300 3 A. Not at this time. feet from this overturned Kenworth they should have 4 5 been able to see it based on -- assuming the lights 6 were on? A. We do lighting and we have to -- there's 6 7 7

A. No, I cannot say that.

Q. So even if the lights were on, you're not able to say one way or the other whether or not they 10 could have even seen the lights?

11 A. I can't say that.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Q. It's possible that these lights were on, that the headlights would be pointed out into the trees, assuming there were even any trees there, and they never would have been able to see them?

DR. ROBINSON:

I'm going to object because anything is possible. We have to ask questions on the basis of the actual facts, and I think those questions are not in line with the factual scenario actually presented.

BY MR. BRITTAIN:

23 Q. Let me ask you this. This is a 24 hypothetical. Assume that the tractor was laying over on its side and the lights were still on, and I

something you're qualified to give expert testimony

Q. You said not at his time. Have you signed up for any classes to learn how to become --

things that we have to apply, but I don't know specifically anything about vehicle lighting, and 9 then it's been such a long time since I've done 10 anything with lighting that I would have to go refresh myself on that situation. 11

Q. Well, tell me if you can answer this question or if you can't, but if you take a headlight of an 18 wheeler, and you shine it off into nothing, just dark, are you going to be able to see the light if you're standing behind it?

A. If I'm standing behind it? It depends. How is the beam deflected? Does he have his low beams or high beams on, those kind of things, you know.

O. Either one. You tell me with low beams.

22 A. He had the low beam on and I'm standing 23 behind him, certainly that's -- I'm not trying to 24 give any expert opinion on what happened here, but

if I'm standing behind a truck and it's shining a

117

JANET L. PARKER & ASSOCIATES, L.L.C. P. O. BOX 3321, BATON ROUGE, LA 70821, 225-344-4559

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2

5

8

9

10

11

17

21

22

8

9

10

11

12

13

A. These photos, and basically these are the only ones that I actually needed.

Q. You're talking about the ones in your book and the ones that we've already marked?

- A. They gave me a whole slew of these, but I just took and printed out the ones that are relevant to me.
- 8 Q. We've marked that as whatever exhibit9 number that is, the five, six pictures?
- 10 A. Yes.

3

4

- Q. And you went through that disk and pulled out all of the ones that are relevant to the issues that you're looking at?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- Q. Do you plan on doing any kind of
 reconstruction film or any kind of drawings or
 anything like that?
- 18 A. No.
- Q. Again, just to make sure I've asked this,
 even assuming the lights are on you don't know
 whether it would be visible to anyone driving down
 the road that night?
- A. Yes. I can't give an opinion on that either way.
- 25 Q. Going through your project notes, which is

Q. It says that it's assumed that light switches were in the on position. Do you know whether -- what that switch is like, whether it's a push in, pull out, flip up, flip down?

124

125

- A. Flip up, flip down.
- Q. Do you know whether that switch was hit or in any way knocked down in the rollover?
 - A. No.
- Q. Is it possible that it could have been hit and flipped down in the rollover and turned out every single light on this 18 wheeler?
- 12 A. There's a number of -- from what I
 13 understand there's a number of these switches, two
 14 or three or more. And I can't say that if it would
 15 hit one that it would turn off all the lights. I
 16 don't think so.
 - Q. Do you know how many switches there are?
- 18 A. It appears -- well, we can look at that. I19 don't know right off. We can look at the schematic
- 20 and get some view of what that would be.
 - Q. Yes, I need to do that.
 - A. We've got -- we show some switches for the
- 23 headlights, which would be one set of switches for
- 24 the headlights. We show some switches for the
- 25 dimmer switch. Other than that that's all they

123

- Exhibit 6, I believe, this kind of sums up your opinions. Is that right?
- 3 A. Yes.

2

7

9

- Q. We've talked about your opinions. You've got four bullets down there. The batteries in this type trailer are mechanically held in place so as to prevent movement. We've gone over all of that,
- 8 haven't we?

A. Yes.

- 10 Q. Then you say, Assuming the battery 11 structures were maintained. We've talked about
- 12 that, right?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. And the wiring was still connected to thepower source.
- 16 A. That's right.
- 17 Q. What are some ways that the wiring could 18 become unconnected to the power source?
- A. They could physically be torn off.
- 20 Q. So bullet No. 2, we've gone over all of 21 that, haven't we?
- 22 A. From what I understand, yes.
- Q. The same with three, we've gone over everything?
- 25 A. Yes.

- show. They have some other switches. I don't thinkthat's the lights.
- Q. What is a dimmer switch? Is that where
 when you ride down sometimes the lights will goyou see them passing sometimes, and they'll say
 thank you by flipping the switch and the lights will
 go from bright to dim?
 - A. It shows this switch right here. It says a number of things below it. It says dimmer switch standard position, push button in turn signal switch, optional position, mounted in floor. So that would be something that might be to select the high beam, low beam.
- Q. So from what you see there though there's
 one switch that would control all the lights and
 then a dimmer switch?
- 17 A. No. They're only showing one switch for
 18 the headlights. They're not showing where the other
 19 switches are for the other lights. The way -- from
- what I understand, the way it works is there's anumber of basically you have power, and these lights
- 22 go out. There's a switch that goes out to a relay.
- 23 Basically this device enables this device which
- 24 turns on the lights from what I understand. That's
- 25 kind of illustrated by this.

			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	120	5	128
1	,	1	DR. ROBINSON:
2	lamp relay, a tail and park relay, dimmer relay, a	2	The expert, not the attorney.
3	number of relays here that goes from what I	3	MR. BRITTAIN:
4	understand these are wired out to an instrument	4	Right.
5	panel harness that's going to go over to these	5	BY MR. BRITTAIN:
6	switches. So it's kind of tough for me to know how	6	Q. I'll let you read I'm going to draw a
7	many switches he has or what the switches were for	7	line here. What I'm doing is I'm circling pages
8	because he's got a whole rack of switches right	8	178, line 20 through 179, line 6. If you'll look at
9	here. There appear to be four to eight that could	9	that.
10	have been used.	10	A. (Examining document.) Okay.
11	There was a conversation we had somewhere	11	Q. All right. Is the fact that would you
12	along the line that these things could be changed.	12	agree with me in that testimony right there Dr.
13	They could be wired a different way, all that kind	13	Robinson is saying he can't tell whether they were
14	of stuff. So I can't accurately I cannot show	14	on after rollover or not?
15	the switches on these schematics, but these right	15	A. Yes.
16	here where they they're shown in this picture	16	DR. ROBINSON:
17	right in here. I would tend to think they would be	17	Are you asking him what now?
18	the ones on the top, which they have four switches,	18	BY MR. BRITTAIN:
19	and then there's I think four switches on the	19	Q. According to that testimony right there Dr.
20	bottom. What they're applied for, I don't know.	20	Robinson is saying he doesn't know whether the
21	Q. You don't know whether those four switches,	21	lights were on after the rollover or not. Is that a
22	whether those have anything to do with actually	22	fair summary of that testimony?
23	turning on and off lights?	23	DR. ROBINSON:
24	A. That's right.	24	Well, I think his testimony is what it
25	Q. And, again, you don't know whether anything	25	is.
	127	\vdash	129
1	could have been changed from the time of this	1	A. He just says, no, I can't. From reading
2	accident through the time of the manufacture	2	here he says, no, I can't; no, I can't.
3	according to that schematic?	3	Q. Does that have any affect on your opinion?
4	A. Correct.	4	A. No.
5	Q. Let me ask you this. Both Mr. Thompson and	5	Q. Let me ask you about this fax we've marked
6	Mr. Tidwell testified in their deposition that they	6	as Exhibit 5. There were portions of this that you
7	were driving down the road going 70 miles an hour,	7	marked out I assume because you were not able to
3	and they were looking straight ahead paying	8	give an opinion, you couldn't provide that opinion.
	attention where they were going, and they never saw	9	Is that fair to say?
0	any lights on this tractor trailer. If that's their	10	A. That's right.
1	testimony, would you disagree with that testimony?	11	Q. One of the things you marked out is that
2	A. I can't I wouldn't be able to comment on	12	there wasn't wasn't any skid mark data. You don't
3	their testimony.	13	know whether there were skid marks or not, do you?
4	Q. All right. Well, are you so sure of your	14	A. I mean I'm an electrical engineer. I don't
5	opinions that you feel like that they should have	15	know anything about skid marks.
6	seen some lights?	16	Q. That's not your deal?
7	A. I think they should have seen something,	17	A. Yes.
8	yes.	18	Q. The Morris tractor trailer was duly
9	Q. You don't know at what point that should	19	equipped with all lighting and reflector assemblies
0 .	have been though?	20	mandated by the US DOT. You aren't able to say
1	A. I can't say that.	21	that, are you?
2	Q. It could have just been 50 feet ahead of	22	A. No, I can't say anything.
3 1	t?	23	Q. We don't know whether this thing was
1	A. I can't say that.	24	properly equipped with the proper lights or not, do
5	Q. Let me Dr. Robinson	25	we? Or can you say that?
	-		

16 you for catching that. 17 MR. BRITTAIN: 18 I'm going to mark the March 28 fax 19 11A, and I'll make these pictures that you 20 drew for me 11B. 21 DR. ROBINSON: 22 11B and 11? 23 MR. BRITTAIN: 24 11A and 11B.

EXAMINATION BY MR. BRITTAIN:

25

reporting method, was prepared and transcribed by me is a true and correct transcript to the best of my ability and understanding; that I am not related to counsel or to the parties herein, nor am I otherwise interested in the outcome of this matter.

> Baton Rouge, Louisiana, on this date, _, 2006.

KELLY G. YOUNG, RPR, CCR Certificate No. 91025 State of Louisiana